ENTERING THE UNITED STATES: THE DIFFERING VIEWS FROM THE NORTHERN TRIANGLE, CUBA AND PUERTO RICO

HERIBERTO FERNANDEZ*

I. BACKGROUND.

The differences in political behavior and priorities of the ethnic groups that form the United States ("U.S.") can prevent political parties and other organizations from effectively engaging each group. This principle is confirmed by an analysis of the migratory experience and political behavior of different ethnic communities residing within the U.S.

This paper will explore the experiences individuals from El Salvador, Guatemala and Honduras, known as "The Northern Triangle", Cuba, and Puerto Rico,²⁸⁵ have migrating to the U.S. It will also consider the effects that U.S. law and policy have, and discuss the political behavior and leanings of their communities once inside the U.S.

All of these nations share a common history that includes Spanish colonization.²⁸⁶ The Spanish conquest of the Northern Triangle countries started in the early 16th century, and by the mid-16th century, most of what is today El Salvador, Guatemala, and Honduras was under the jurisdiction of the Audiencia de Guatemala, an administrative body established by the Spaniards.²⁸⁷

^{*} Juris Doctor Candidate, South Texas College of Law Houston, 2020.

²⁸⁵ Jon Greenberg, Migrants at the Southwest Border: The Northern Triangle Nations, POLITIFACT (July 2, 2018, 11:46 AM), https://www.politifact.com/truth-o-meter/article/2018/jul/02/migrants-southwest-border-northern-triangle-nation/ [http://perma.cc/5V6V-C2B9].

²⁸⁶ Guatemala, Audiencia of. ENCYCLOPEDIA OF LATIN AMERICAN HISTORY AND CULTURE, Encyclopedia.com (last visited 25 May. 2019), https://www.encyclopedia.com/humanities/encyclopedias-almanacs-transcripts-and-maps/guatemala-audiencia [http://perma.cc/HYT7-3PFT].

²⁸⁷ Id.

During the early 17th century, this area and neighboring Mexico gained independence from Spanish rule.²⁸⁸ A short-lived Central American Federation followed the liberation from Spain and, subsequently, from Mexico, but the three countries eventually asserted their sovereign powers by the mid-19th century.²⁸⁹ ²⁹⁰ ²⁹¹

Puerto Rico was settled by the Spaniards in 1508 and remained under Spanish control until 1898.²⁹² On December 10, 1898 the signing of the Treaty of Paris meant not only the end of the Spanish-American war, but that Puerto Rico became a possession of the U.S.²⁹³

The first Spanish settlement in Cuba, Baracoa, was founded in 1512.²⁹⁴ By 1898, Cuba gained its independence from Spain, and eventually it became a republic in 1902.²⁹⁵ Cuba also shares, with Puerto Rico and the Northern Triangle, a history of centuries spent under Spanish control.

The experience an individual from each of these three regions has entering the U.S. will influence what the local communities, formed by these immigrants, will prioritize politically. For the Hispanic community in the U.S.,

²⁸⁸ I.A

²⁸⁹ The Editors of Encyclopaedia Britannica, *United Provinces of Central America*, ENCYCLOPÆDIA BRITANNICA (Feb. 28, 2019), https://www.britannica.com/place/United-Provinces-of-Central-America [http://perma.cc/PX7J-XMQH].

²⁹⁰ Supra note 2.

²⁹¹ David Bushnell & Ralph Lee Woodward, Central America: The Habsburg period (1524–1700), ENCYCLOPÆDIA BRITANNICA (Dec. 20, 2018), https://www.britannica.com/place/Central-America/The-Habsburg-period-1524-1700#ref40852 [http://perma.cc/2]KY-2M3]].

²⁹² Thomas G. Mathews, et al, *Puerto Rico – History*, ENCYCLOPÆDIA BRITANNICA (May 18, 2019), https://www.britannica.com/place/Puerto-Rico/History [http://perma.cc/MS92-65RB].

²⁹³ Treaty of Peace between the United States of American and the Kingdom of Spain, Dec. 10, 1898, 30 Stat. 1754; TS 343; 11 Bevans 615 (commonly known as the Treaty of Paris).

²⁹⁴ The Editors of Encyclopaedia Britannica, *Baracoa: Cuba*, ENCYCLOPÆDIA BRITANNICA (last updated Dec. 03, 2018), https://www.britannica.com/place/Baracoa [http://perma.cc/UDD3-RHZZ].

²⁹⁵ The Editors of Encyclopaedia Britannica, *Cuban Independence* Movement, ENCYCLOPAEDIA BRITANNICA, https://www.britannica.com/event/Cuban-Independence-Movement [http://perma.cc/PNE3-FL6X].

this means differences in political behavior and motivations that political parties should consider when attempting to reach out to each of these communities. Subsequently, U.S. law and its treatment of immigrants is entrenched into their communities and affects their political motivations and behavior.

II. ENTERING THE UNITED STATES.

A. Northern Triangle experience.

In 2015, 3.4 million individuals born in the Northern Triangle were present in the U.S., and 1.9 million of these individuals were inside the country without documentation.²⁹⁶ Natives or nationals of Guatemala, Honduras, and El Salvador who want to immigrate to the U.S. without a visa frequently make their way to the southwest border.

In Fiscal Year ("FY") 2018, the U.S. awarded 32,169 immigrant visas to individuals from the Northern Triangle.²⁹⁷ Immediate Relative visas accounted for 61% of the visas awarded to individuals from this region, and Family Presence visas made up another 38%.²⁹⁸ A combined total of forty-six Diversity visas were awarded to individuals from Honduras and Guatemala, and none were awarded to persons from El Salvador.²⁹⁹

Non-Immigrant visas, allowing a temporary presence inside the U.S., are awarded in larger numbers than immigrant visas to nationals from the Northern Triangle. In FY 2018, 127,209 non-immigrant visas were awarded, a decrease

²⁹⁶ Rocio Cara Labrador, et al, *Central America's Violent Northern Triangle*, COUNCIL ON FOREIGN RELATIONS (last updated June 26, 2018), https://www.cfr.org/backgrounder/central-americas-violent-northern-triangle [http://perma.cc/SFY2-J75B].

²⁹⁷ U.S. Dep't of State, *Table III: Immigrant V isas Issued (by Foreign State of Chargeability or Place of Birth): Fiscal Year 2018*, IN REPORT OF THE VISA OFFICE 2018, https://travel.state.gov/content/dam/visas/Statistics/AnnualReports/FY2018AnnualReport/

 $^{^{298}}Id.$

²⁹⁹ Id.

from the 155,710 granted in 2017.³⁰⁰ Non-immigrant visas awarded to Hondurans were responsible for the drop, year-over-year, as the total decreased by 40% in 2018.³⁰¹

The estimated millions of undocumented immigrants from the Northern Triangle currently in the U.S. are a combination of visa overstays and those who entered without any documentation. In FY 2017, the U.S. government estimated there were 10,268 B1 or B2 in-country-visa-overstays from the Northern Triangle, with Guatemalans accounting for 40% of those estimated overstays.³⁰²

There is no exact measure as to how many individuals make the journey annually from the Northern Triangle to the U.S. southwest border. In 2018, a total of 225,572 individuals from the region were apprehended by the U.S. Customs and Border Protection ("CBP").³⁰³ Ninety-nine percent of those apprehensions took place at the southwest border.³⁰⁴ The 2018 total reflects an increase of more than 400% from those apprehended in 2007.³⁰⁵ However, 808,688 Mexicans were apprehended in 2007 but that number dropped to 155,452 in 2018.³⁰⁶

In 2018, the CBP reported that 38,189 unaccompanied alien children

³⁰⁰ U.S. Dep't of State, *Table XVIII: Nonimmigrant Visas Issued by Nationality (Including Border Crossing Cards) Fiscal Years 2009-2018*, IN REPORT OF THE VISA OFFICE 2018, https://travel.state.gov/content/dam/visas/Statistics/AnnualReports/FY2018AnnualReport/FY18AnnualReport%20-%20TableXVIII.pdf [http://perma.cc/2NTR-2YNG].

³⁰¹ Id.

³⁰² U.S. Dep't of Homeland Security, *Table 3: Non-VWP Country B1/B2 Overstay Rates*, IN FISCAL YEAR 2017: ENTRY EXIT OVERSTAY REPORT, Oct. 2017, at 15, https://www.dhs.gov/sites/default/files/publications/18 0807 S1 Entry-Exit-Overstay Report.pdf [http://perma.cc/QA72-P2E6].

³⁰³ U.S. Customs and Border Protection, U.S. BORDER PATROL NATIONWIDE APPREHENSIONS BY CITIZENSHIP AND SECTOR FYS 07-18, https://www.cbp.gov/sites/default/files/assets/documents/2019-

Mar/BP%20Apps%20by%20Sector%20and%20Citizenship%20FY07-FY18.pdf, (last visited May 26, 2019) [http://perma.cc/7685-QWNB].

³⁰⁴ Id. at 35-36.

³⁰⁵ *Id.* at 1-2.

³⁰⁶ Id. at 1-2, 35-36.

from the Northern Triangle were apprehended at the southwest border.³⁰⁷ Fifty-eight percent of the unaccompanied children were from Guatemala, 29% were from Honduras and the remaining 13% were from El Salvador.³⁰⁸

For the thousands that make the trip from the Northern Triangle up through Mexico to the U.S. border every year, the experience can consist of a series of physical, mental and emotional challenges. As chronicled in a recent *New York Times* article, a young man from El Salvador can take a route through Guatemala and Mexico via human smuggling networks.³⁰⁹ He must pay these smugglers by selling personal assets, tapping into personal savings, or with money sent from family abroad.³¹⁰

This contract entered into with the smugglers does not have the best warranties. This young man from was at risk of running into cartels in Mexico, stayed at sometimes unsanitary buildings and did not have reliable medical attention during his trip.³¹¹ His family in the U.S. was in frequent communication via cellphone with him as he made his way north, through Mexico.³¹²

This cellphone provided a link for family members to stay abreast of his movements and ensured that his uncle could locate him, confirm that he was alive and also aided in scheduling a series of payments made to the smugglers at different points of the journey.³¹³

Throughout the journey, he reported fearing for his life and that he was

309 Nicholas Kulish, What it Costs to be Smuggled across the U.S. Border, NY TIMES (June 30, 2018), https://www.nytimes.com/interactive/2018/06/30/world/smuggling-illegal-immigration-costs.html [http://perma.cc/5ZA2-KR3B].

³⁰⁷ U.S. Dep't of Homeland Security, U.S. Border Patrol Nationwide Apprehensions by Sector FY 2017, Department of Homeland Security (last modified Feb. 11, 2019), https://www.cbp.gov/newsroom/stats/usbp-sw-border-apprehensions-fy2017 [http://perma.ccUP9U-TLPQ].

³⁰⁸ *Id*.

³¹⁰ Id.

³¹¹ *Id*.

³¹² *Id*.

³¹³ *Id*.

unable to remain calm during certain parts of the trip.³¹⁴ He feared running the fate of friends who had been hurt or raped while trying to make it to the U.S. border.³¹⁵ At other times, he had to hide in buses and tractor-trailers to avoid authorities in Mexico.³¹⁶

In Mexico, the ultimate destination for the thousands attempting to cross the southwest border, it is reported that police officials can be bribed at different points of the journey.³¹⁷ If the bribe is not paid, officials will impede the individuals from reaching the border.³¹⁸ This type of activity further undermines the safety of the immigrant.

The reality of the trip up north does not spare women or children. A 2013 photo essay featured in *The Atlantic* documented the experience of Elvira Lopez, a Guatemalan woman making the journey to the U.S.³¹⁹ The 22-year old had fallen asleep while on top of a train when a tree branch knocked her off.³²⁰ The fall led to the amputation of her right leg and caused her to spend months convalescing in a shelter in Tapachula, Mexico.³²¹ The shelter is funded by donations and tries to help wounded immigrants, like Lopez, obtain prosthetics.³²²

The photo essay also chronicled the story of Daniela, a twenty-year-old transgender, Honduran immigrant. ³²³ Daniela was staying at a shelter in Ixtepec,

³¹⁴ *Id*.

³¹⁵ *Id*.

³¹⁶ *Id*.

³¹⁷ T.A

³¹⁸ Molly Hennessy-Fiske, *Migrants say Border Agents Wants Bribes*, VALLEY NEWS (Nov. 22, 2018), https://www.vnews.com/Asylum-seekers-blocked-at-Texas-border-bridges-say-mexican-officials-are-demanding-money-to-let-them-pass-21725151 [http://perma.cc/C6JH-375R].

³¹⁹ Alan Taylor, *An Immigrant's Journey*, THE ATLANTIC (Aug. 13, 2013), https://www.theatlantic.com/photo/2013/08/an-immigrants-journey/100573/ [http://perma.cc/V3NQ-YNJ6].

³²⁰ *Id*.

³²¹ *Id*.

³²² Id.

³²³ Id.

as she waited for Mexican authorities to process documents that would allow her to take a bus to the U.S. border.³²⁴ The bus ride was a safer alternative for her, compared to the freight trains, for moving further north. ³²⁵

Once inside the U.S., some undocumented individuals from the Northern Triangle will be taken by human smugglers to specific locations. On May 23, 2018, eighty-six undocumented immigrants, including four children, were found by police inside an eighteen-wheeler near Raymondville, Texas suffering from dehydration. Individuals from the Northern Triangle countries made up part of this particular immigrant group along with individuals from Mexico and Nicaragua. Mexico and Nicaragua.

On July 23, 2017, thirty-nine immigrants were found inside a tractor-trailer in San Antonio, Texas.³²⁸ Ten immigrants died and the survivors detailed the terrible heat they endured inside the trailer.³²⁹ The police investigation revealed the immigrants, some from Guatemala and El Salvador, had entered the U.S. through the southwest border in different groups and were crammed inside the trailer to be transported covertly to a destination.³³⁰

Those immigrants who are apprehended trying to cross the border can win parole and be allowed into the U.S. if they meet certain asylum and refugee criteria.³³¹ In FY 2018, 6,240 asylum decisions were made on applications filed by Hondurans, 8,232 on applications brought by Salvadorans, and on 6,052 filed

 $^{^{324}}$ *Id*.

³²⁵ Id.

³²⁶ Fernando del Valle, *86 Immigrants Found in Trailer Near Raymondville*, THE MONITOR (May 23, 2018), https://www.themonitor.com/2018/05/23/86-immigrants-found-in-trailer-near-raymondville/ [http://perma.cc/XGQ5-JPHB].

³²⁷ Id.

³²⁸ CBS AP, At Least 9 Dead in Immigrant-Smuggling Attempt in San Antonio, CBS NEWS (July 23, 2017 at 7:37 AM), https://perma.cc/V7DJ-DKJC].

³²⁹ Id.

³³⁰ Id.

⁴⁷ U.S. Dep't of Homeland Security, *Asylum*, (last reviewed/updated on Nov. 12, 2015), https://www.uscis.gov/humanitarian/refugees-asylum/asylum [http://perma.cc/S29W-AR6K].

by Guatemalans.³³² Salvadorans were granted asylum at rate of 23.5%, higher than the 21.2% for Hondurans and 18.8% for Guatemalans.³³³

Defensive Asylum cases filed by individuals from the Northern Triangle totaled 76,328 in 2017, an increase from the 29,506 applications filed in 2014.³³⁴ Affirmative Asylum cases filed by individuals from the Northern Triangle increased from 20,557 in 2015 to 31,066 in 2017.³³⁵

Eventually, the individual or family will settle in a community with family members or near a labor source. In 2012, the Houston area was home to 180,000 individuals born in the Northern Triangle. Between 2000 and 2012, the Honduran foreign-born population in the area grew by 132% and the Guatemalan by 130%, the largest for any immigrant group during that time period. Salvador accounts for the largest share of individuals at 104,000, or 59% of individuals from the Northern Triangle in the Houston area.

Despite having the largest foreign-born population growth in Houston, Hondurans and Guatemalans, born outside of the U.S., have the lowest naturalizations rates in the area. El Salvadorans naturalized at a rate of 24%, Guatemalans 17%, and Hondurans 14%.³³⁹ Individuals from Vietnam had the highest naturalization rate in the Houston area, at 74%, and the Philippine community had the second highest at 61%.³⁴⁰

³³² TRAC Immigration, Asylum decisions and denials jump in 2018, Syracuse University (Nov. 29, 2018), https://trac.syr.edu/immigration/reports/539/ [http://perma.cc/T7W6-GTNQ].

³³⁴ U.S. Dep't of Homeland Security, Annual Flow Report Refugees and Asylees: 2017 (March 2019), https://www.dhs.gov/sites/default/files/publications/Refugees_Asylees_2017.pdf [http://perma.cc/X57X-GA4F].

³³⁵ *Id.* at 7.

³³⁶Randy Capps, et al, *A Profile of Immigrants in Houston, The Nation's Most Diverse Metropolitan Area*, Migration Policy Institute (March 2015), https://www.migrationpolicy.org/research/profile-immigrants-houston-nations-most-diverse-metropolitan-area [http://perma.cc/X57X-GA4F].

³³⁷ *Id.* at 6.

³³⁸ *Id.* at 5.

³³⁹ Id. at 7.

³⁴⁰ Id. at 7.

The Northern Triangle communities within the Houston area have the largest share of foreign-born population that is in the U.S. without authorization.³⁴¹ For Guatemalans it's 61%, for Hondurans, 51%, and for El Salvador, 27%.³⁴² Mexico, at 47%, is the only non-Northern Triangle country to make the top four in this category.³⁴³

The Northern Triangle immigrant community in the Houston area has lower levels of median household income and education than other immigrant groups in the area. Hondurans had a median household income of \$28,000, Guatemalans of \$33,000, and Salvadorans of \$37,000.³⁴⁴ In contrast, Indian households earned \$93,000 and Colombian households earned \$56,000.³⁴⁵ Among immigrant groups, the three northern triangle nations have the highest percentages of adults, twenty-five or older, that failed to complete high school.³⁴⁶

The lack of education, income and documentation means the immigrant will lead a very different lifestyle, all to conceal their legal status. They must stay out of trouble with the law while working and raising a family. This lifestyle can cause psychological and emotional pressures on individuals, families and the communities they inhabit.

The American Psychological Association ("APA") has concluded that undocumented youth and children are exposed to stressful situations because of their legal status.³⁴⁷ These situations include racial profiling, exposure to gangs, immigration raids in their communities, forcible separation from their parents, and more.³⁴⁸ In turn, these stressful events can lead to symptoms of

342 Id. at 4.

³⁴¹ *Id.* at 4.

³⁴³ Id. at 4.

³⁴⁴ Id. at 12.

³⁴⁵ Id. at 12.

³⁴⁶ Id. at 14.

³⁴⁷ American Psychological Ass'n, *Undocumented Americans What is it Like to Grow Up as an Undocumented Youth in America*, https://www.apa.org/topics/immigration/undocumented-video.aspx (last visited on May. 25, 2019) [http://perma.cc/N8SK-L7P9].

³⁴⁸ *Id.*

psychological and emotional suffering.³⁴⁹

The APA research documented frequent crying, disruptions in sleeping and eating habits, depression, poor identity formation, difficulty forming relationships and feelings of persecution as some of the symptoms shown by children who were separated from their undocumented parents.³⁵⁰

The law of the state in which the immigrant resides will determine how hard living a normal life will be. Life in a state that gives ID cards or drivers licenses to undocumented immigrants will make an individual less anxious than in a state that does not, such as Alabama and Texas.³⁵¹

In 2011, Alabama passed House Bill 56, a law that targeted unauthorized immigrants in the state.³⁵² The law's provisions included the criminalization of solicitation of work by unauthorized immigrants, and requiring schools K-12 to inquire about the immigration status of newly enrolled students.³⁵³ A lawsuit filed by the Southern Poverty Law Center and other organizations challenged the law and in 2011 these two provisions, and others of the House Bill, were invalidated in a settlement agreement.³⁵⁴

In 2017, despite the settlement, attorneys and activists in Alabama complained that it was not clear if some provisions of House Bill 56 were still valid.³⁵⁵ Among those provisions singled out in the complaints are the

³⁴⁹ *Id*.

³⁵⁰ I.d

³⁵¹ Gilberto Mendoza, *States Offering Driver's Licenses to Immigrants*, NAT'L CONF. STATE LEGISLATURES (Nov. 13, 2016), http://www.ncsl.org/research/immigration/states-offering-driver-s-licenses-to-immigrants.aspx [http://perma.cc/U8A3-3GAV].

³⁵² Connor Sheets, Alabama's 2011 Anti-Immigrant Law H.B. 56 Still on Books, Gets New Life Under Trump, BIRMINGHAM REAL-TIME NEWS (Mar 24, 2017), https://www.al.com/news/birmingham/index.ssf/2017/03/hb 56 alabamas 2011 anti-immig.html [http://perma.cc/9NRP-8T44]; Beason-Hammon Alabama Taxpayer and Citizen Protection Act, 2011 ALA. LAWS 888 (codified at ALA. CODE §§ 31-13-1 to 31-13-30).

³⁵⁴ Id.; See also Hispanic Interest Coal. of Ala. v. Bentley. No. 5:11–CV–2484–SLB, 2011 WL 5516953 (N.D. Ala, Sept. 28, 2011) aff'd in pt., vacating in pt., rev'd in pt. by Hispanic Interest Coal. of Ala. v. Governor of Ala., 691 F.3d 1236 (11th Cir. 2012);

³⁵⁵ *Id*.

prohibition on undocumented immigrants enrolling in public universities and a provision mandating the E-verify system to employers with less than twenty-five employees.³⁵⁶ The continuing debate about House Bill 56 is a testament as to how broad the bill is in targeting the life of undocumented immigrants.

Routine traffic stops can lead to the detention of an undocumented immigrant. In 2018, ten undocumented immigrants from Guatemala, Honduras and Mexico were arrested in Delaware after jumping from a vehicle during a routine traffic stop.³⁵⁷ In Texas, police reportedly provided the names of undocumented immigrants obtained during certain traffic stops to the CBP.³⁵⁸

Undocumented immigrants from the Northern Triangle can face threats to their lives from gangs such as MS-13 which prey on new arrivals for gang recruitment.³⁵⁹ Because the immigrants do not necessarily trust the police, they can find themselves in situations where the state is not able to protect them.

The story of Maria Reyes, from El Salvador, was chronicled in Vox, after her teenage daughter was murdered by MS-13 members in 2015. ³⁶⁰ The Vox story included details on how two MS-13 members had begun targeting a young girl from El Salvador at a Maryland high-school. ³⁶¹

This tragic story is reflective of how Northern Triangle immigrants,

³⁵⁶ *Id*.

³⁵⁷ Scott Morefield, 10 Illegal Immigrants Arrested after Jumping out of Car during Traffic Stop, THE DAILY CALLER (10:44 PM 12/06/2018), https://dailycaller.com/2018/12/06/illegal-immigrants-arrested-ice-detainer/ [https://perma.cc/2FLE-TT7L].

³⁵⁸ Suzanne Gamboa, *A Traffic Violation Could Mean a Call from ICE for Some in Texas*, NBC NEWS (June 15, 2018, 2:38 PM CDT / Updated Jun. 15, 2018, 5:05 PM CDT), https://www.nbcnews.com/news/latino/texas-highway-patrol-sharing-lists-people-given-traffic-tickets-immigration-n883696 [http://perma.cc/3YRL-NVL6].

³⁵⁹ Justin Jouvenal, Dan Morse and Michael E. Miller, MS-13 Gains Recruits and Power in U.S. As Teens Surge Across Border, WASH. POST (June 17, 2017), https://www.washingtonpost.com/local/public-safety/ms-13-gains-recruits-and-power-in-us-as-teens-surge-across-border/2017/06/16/aacea62a-3989-11e7-a058-

ddbb23c75d82 story.html?utm term=.64bd1099cc00 [http://perma.cc/CRV8-SHMK].

360 Dara Lind, MS-13, Explained, VOX (updated Feb 5, 2019, 9:45pm EST), https://www.vox.com/policy-and-politics/2018/2/26/16955936/ms-13-trump-immigrants-crime [http://perma.cc/7BFT-278D].

³⁶¹ *Id*.

documented and undocumented, share a background that can impede successful assimilation into American society. As a group, immigrants from the Northern Triangle have among the lowest rates of education, compared to all other immigrants in the U.S.³⁶² In addition, their English proficiency is lower, which can cause further miscommunication and misunderstanding among individuals from the Northern Triangle and non-Spanish speakers in the U.S.³⁶³

In 1999, thousands of Hondurans in the U.S. were allowed to apply for Temporary Protected Status ("TPS").³⁶⁴ The TPS provides a way to avoid deportation and receive an Employment Authorization Document.³⁶⁵ Petitioners must meet a series of requirements to apply and renew TPS.³⁶⁶ One requirement is that the individual must have been continuously physically present in the U.S. since the effective date of the most recent designation date of his or her country.³⁶⁷ In 2018, the U.S. government announced it would work to end the program, thereby attempting to remove temporary status from tens of thousands of Hondurans.³⁶⁸

³⁶² D'Vera Cohn, et al., Rise in U.S. Immigrants from El Salvador, Guatemala and Honduras Outpaces Growth from Elsewhere: Geography and Characteristics of Northern Triangle Immigrants, (Dec. 7, 2017) http://www.pewhispanic.org/2017/12/07/geography-and-characteristics-of-northern-triangle-immigrants/ [http://perma.cc/TG4L-EZBN].

³⁶³ D'Vera Cohn, et al. Rise in U.S. Immigrants from El Salvador, Guatemala and Honduras Outpaces Growth from Elsewhere: Northern Triangle Immigrants less likely to be English proficient than U.S. immigrants overall, (Dec. 7, 2017), http://perma.cc/6RKD-HNMQ].

³⁶⁴ Temporary Protected Status Designated by Country: Honduras, https://www.uscis.gov/humanitarian/temporary-protected-status/temporary-protected-status-designated-country-honduras (last reviewed/updated: Mar. 27, 2019) [http://perma.cc/SE4C-7Q3Y].

³⁶⁶ Temporary Protected Status: What is TPS? https://www.uscis.gov/humanitarian/temporary-protected-status (last reviewed/updated: May 13, 2019) [http://perma.cc/D5CT-D69P].

³⁶⁷ Temporary Protected Status Designated by Country: Honduras, https://www.uscis.gov/humanitarian/temporary-protected-status/temporary-protected-status-designated-country-honduras. (last reviewed/updated Mar. 27, 2019) [http://perma.cc/QQ7Y-GPAL].

³⁶⁸ Dara Lind, Trump Tells 57,000 Hondurans Who've Lived in the US for 20 Years to Get Out: It's Yet Another Move That Will Turn People Who are in the US Legally into Unauthorized Immigrants, VOX (May 4, 2018, 4:25pm EDT), https://www.vox.com/2018/5/4/17320352/tps-honduras-

In 2001, TPS designation was extended to individuals from El Salvador after earthquakes struck the country.³⁶⁹ ³⁷⁰ The U.S. government has tried to end TPS, ³⁷¹ but the designation is currently in place due to a national injunction ordered in Ramos, et al v. Nielsen, et al.³⁷² So far, TPS designations were awarded to 262,526 individuals from El Salvador and 86,031 from Honduras.³⁷³

Texas has 36,300 Salvadoran TPS beneficiaries, of which 16,991 live in the Houston metropolitan area.³⁷⁴ The State of Texas would lose an estimated \$1.8 billion from its Gross Domestic Product if these Salvadoran TPS workers were removed.³⁷⁵ A fifth of those workers are in the construction industry.³⁷⁶ In addition, Houston is home to approximately 6,060 Honduran TPS beneficiaries.³⁷⁷

A survey of Honduran and Salvadoran TPS holders in six cities around the U.S. found 94% of men, and 82.1% of women were participating in the labor

cancel-trump-temporary-protected-status4444 [http://perma.cc/ 9BX8-8U5D].

³⁶⁹ Temporary Protected Status Designated County: El Salvador, https://www.uscis.gov/humanitarian/temporary-protected-status/temporary-protected-status-designated-country-el-salvador. (last reviewed/updated Mar. 1, 2018) [http://perma.cc/LFV6-MFQ7].

³⁷⁰ Nancy Flores, Salvadorans Could Lose Protected Status in U.S., STATESMAN (Posted Jan 8, 2018 at 12:01 AM Updated Sep 25, 2018 at 8:34 PM), https://www.statesman.com/news/20180108/salvadorans-could-lose-protected-status-in-us [http://perma.cc/R7BR-4BYL].

³⁷¹ *Id*.

³⁷² See Ramos, et al v. Nielsen, et al., 336 F. Supp.3d 1075 (N.D. Cal. 2018).

³⁷³ Table I. TPS Beneficiaries by Country of Citizenship, in Temporary Protected Status: Overview and Current Issues, Cong. Res. Serv. Rep. RS20844, at 5 (Updated October 10, 2018), https://www.everycrsreport.com/files/20181010 RS20844 9fda549df539d8fcfb32f38113383 8fbb08cc46d.pdf [http://perma.cc/FZ7L-9YVV].

³⁷⁴ Ileana Najarro, *Trump is Ending Protections for Immigrants from El Salvador. Here's What That Means for Houston*, HOUS. CHRON. (last updated: Jan. 8, 2018 11:42 P.M.), https://www.houstonchronicle.com/news/houston-texas/houston/article/Trump-is-ending-protections-for-immigrants-from-12482458.php [http://perma.cc/4Z8M-Y7M3].

³⁷⁵ *Id*.

³⁷⁶ *Id*.

³⁷⁷ Zuzana Cepla, *Temporary Protected Status: Fact Sheet*, https://immigrationforum.org/article/fact-sheet-temporary-protected-status/. (last visited May 20, 2019) [http://perma.cc/N4VW-UU3B].

force.³⁷⁸ More than half of men and women with TPS work more than forty hours a week and their average monthly income was \$2,910.³⁷⁹ Twenty-three percent of the men work in construction or painting, and 16.1% of the women are employed in cleaning buildings.³⁸⁰ Almost half have furthered their education since arriving in the U.S.³⁸¹

B. Cuban experience.

In contrast to those migrating from the Northern Triangle, the law and policy of the U.S. is unique towards the people of Cuba. Cubans were not extended citizenship like Puerto Ricans, but since the 1960s the U.S. has allowed large waves of political refugees from the island to naturalize. The Cuban Adjustment Act ("CAA"), enacted in 1966, permits Cubans to apply for lawful permanent residency. 382 383

By the end of the Cuban revolution in January 1959, there were almost 60,600 Cubans residing in the U.S.³⁸⁴ By 2016, 2.14 million individuals of Cuban heritage or those born in Cuba, were residing in the U.S.³⁸⁵ Throughout the

³⁷⁸ Cecilia Menjivar, Temporary Protected Status in the United States: The Experiences of Honduran and Salvadoran Immigrants, (Center for Migration Research, The University of Kansas, May 2017), http://ipsr.ku.edu/migration/pdf/TPS_Report.pdf. [http://perma.cc/WHL8-VPWW].

³⁷⁹ *Id*.

³⁸⁰ Id.

³⁸¹ Id

³⁸² U.S. Dep't of Homeland Security, *Green Card for a Cuban Native or Citizen*, https://www.uscis.gov/greencard/caa (last reviewed/updated Jan. 10, 2018) [http://perma.cc/L6EH-9BDQ].

³⁸³ Chap. 23 Adjustment of Status to Lawful Permanent Resident: Cuban Adjustment Act Cases, IN ADJUDICATOR'S FIELD MANUAL, https://www.uscis.gov/ilink/docView/AFM/HTML/AFM/0-0-0-1/0-0-8624/0-0-0-10170.html. (last visited May 20, 2019) [http://perma.cc/ZP39-G6BS].

³⁸⁴ Jorge Duany, *Cuban Migration: A Postrevolution Exodus Ebbs and Flows*, (Washington D.C.: Migration Policy Institute, 2017), https://www.migrationpolicy.org/article/cuban-migration-postrevolution-exodus-ebbs-and-flows [http://perma.cc/U82V-JZU6].

³⁸⁵ U.S. Census Bureau, *The Hispanic Population in the United States: 2016: Table.2 Population by Sex, Age, and Hispanic Origin type*, https://www.census.gov/data/tables/2016/demo/hispanic-origin/2016-cps.html (last revised Aug. 29, 2018) [http://perma.cc/V9MM-7NGT].

decades, several distinct waves of Cuban immigrants arrived and were admitted into the U.S.³⁸⁶

Diplomatic relations between Cuba and the U.S. were inconsistent throughout the decades following the Cuban revolution, leading to variations in policy that have included the Wet Foot, Dry Foot policy.³⁸⁷ Announced in 1995, this policy permitted Cubans who reached the U.S. to be paroled, but those without visas, who were intercepted at sea, were returned to Cuba.³⁸⁸ The individuals who did make it to the U.S. could then apply for a green card.

In January 2017, President Obama announced the end of the Wet Foot, Dry Foot policy.³⁸⁹ Cubans that reached U.S. land after the change are now treated like immigrants from any other nation instead of being paroled into the country.³⁹⁰ This announcement led to a spike in Cuban immigration in the months leading up to the end of the policy.³⁹¹ Southwest border crossings increased 24% in 2016, compared to 2015 and the number of Cubans detained at sea by the U.S. increased by 64%, totaling 7,400.³⁹²

Entering the U.S. can be a varied experience for Cuban immigrants. Historically, Cubans have used at least three routes to enter the U.S. without a visa. One route may be sea travel from Cuba to south Florida. A second route consists of flying to Central or South America and then making the journey up through Mexico to cross the Southwest Border. A third route is crossing to Hispaniola and then crossing by boat the Mona Strait to Puerto Rico. ³⁹³

³⁸⁷ *Id*.

³⁸⁶ *Id.*

³⁸⁸ Id.

³⁸⁹ Michelle Mendez, *The End of the Wet Foot, Dry Foot' Cuban Policy*, Catholic Legal Immigration Network, Inc., (https://cliniclegal.org/resources/end-wet-foot-dry-foot-cuban-policy) (last visited May 20 2019) [http://perma.cc/SQ6J-HDZW].

³⁹⁰ Duany, supra note 100.

³⁹¹ Id.

³⁹² Id.

³⁹³ Otros 21 Migrantes Cubanos Arriban a Isla de Mona, Puerto Rico, Radio Television Marti (July 15, 2016), https://www.radiotelevisionmarti.com/a/otros-21-migrantes-cubanos-arriban-isla-mona-puerto-rico/126059.html [http://perma.cc/BRR6-TS2Y].

The *New York Times* published a story on the hundreds of Cubans who were quickly processed and admitted to the U.S. at the southwest border, under the Wet Foot, Dry Foot policy.³⁹⁴ The treatment they received was resented by the Mexican-American community in the border town of Laredo, Texas.³⁹⁵ Congressman Henry Cuellar said the community had felt resentment because Central American immigrants are not treated the same under U.S. law.³⁹⁶

The Cubans were allowed entry into Laredo, after being processed for a few hours, and once there, they could immediately apply for certain social benefits.³⁹⁷ On the other hand, Central Americans were apprehended and had to go through the immigration court system and hope to win asylum, or other relief.³⁹⁸

The 103-mile boat trip, at its shortest, from Cuba to south Florida has been an escape valve for Cuba. During the 1980 Mariel boatlift, thousands of boats carried tens of thousands of Cubans over to Florida. The U.S.-Cuban community members sponsored boats to pick up and to help bring Cubans to shores.

Cubans who attempt to reach Puerto Rico by boat from Hispaniola, navigating the waters separating the Dominican Republic and Puerto Rico, risk their lives. In October 2016, fourteen Cuban immigrants were rescued from a small island off the Puerto Rican coast. They had become stranded on a natural

³⁹⁴ Julia Preston, *Tension Simmers as Cubans Breeze across U.S. Border*, N.Y. TIMES (Feb. 12, 2016), https://www.nytimes.com/2016/02/13/us/as-cubans-and-central-americans-enter-us-the-welcomes-vary.html [http://perma.cc/CAH4-EENN].

³⁹⁵ *Id.*

³⁹⁶ Id.

³⁹⁷ Id.

³⁹⁸ Id

³⁹⁹ Diana Nyad, *Cuba: So Close You Could Almost Swim There*, HUFFINGTON POST (Jan. 29, 2015 10:38 am ET last updated Dec 06, 2017), https://www.huffingtonpost.com/diana-nyad/cuba-so-close-you-could-a-b-6571342.html [http://perma.cc/5DWU-MTPS].

⁴⁰⁰ Andrew Glass, *Castro launches Mariel Boatlift, April 20, 1980*, POLITICO (Apr. 20, 2018 12:12 AM EDT), https://www.politico.com/story/2018/04/20/castro-launches-mariel-boatlift-april-20-1980-528819 [http://perma.cc/X9EJ-K6Y3].

⁴⁰¹ Id.

reserve and were rescued by the U.S. Coast Guard. 402

In June 2016, the CBP office in Aguadilla, Puerto Rico, stated it had detained and processed 225 Cuban immigrants to date. 403 By July, another fortyone Cuban immigrants had reached Isla de Mona, Puerto Rico. 404 The Chief Agent for the CBP Ramey Sector, Ramiro Cerrillo, said traffickers will abandon immigrants on Isla de Mona despite knowing how dangerous it is. 405 Isla de Mona is a small island, a three to four hour boat ride from Puerto Rico and is considered inhospitable. 406

For decades Cubans were forced to choose one of the previously discussed routes to reach the U.S., a direct result of the inconsistent relations between the two countries. For example, commercial flights between Cuba and the U.S. were not authorized between 1962 and 2016. 407 However, in the 1960s there was the Freedom Flights program, a refugee resettlement initiative. 408 The U.S. sponsored program consisted of daily charted flights between Varadero, Cuba and Miami, Florida. 409 The 260,600 persons that arrived via Freedom flights included more blue-collar and service workers than previous Cuban immigration waves. 410

In a 2018 article, the Miami Herald, described Cubans as 'no longer

⁴⁰² Cubanos Realizan Peligrosas Travesías Para Llegar A Puerto Rico Vía República Dominicana, PRIMERAHORA (Dec. 15, 2010, 01:20 p.m), https://www.primerahora.com/noticias/mundo/nota/cubanosrealizanpeligrosastravesiasparal legarapuertoricoviarepublicadominicana-453080/ [http://perma.cc/OAP5-RNLW].

⁴⁰³ Otros 21 Migrantes, supra note 109.

⁴⁰⁴ *Id*.

⁴⁰⁵ *Id*.

⁴⁰⁶ Isla de Mona, WIKIPEDIA (last updated 17 May 2019, at 23:49 (UTC), https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Isla de Mona [http://perma.cc/TB7R-A5E2].

⁴⁰⁷ Cuban Research Institute, Steven J. Green School of International & Public Affairs, Florida International University, *Chronology of U.S. Cuba Relations*, https://cri.fiu.edu/us-cuba/chronology-of-us-cuba-relations/ (last visited May 22, 2019) [http://perma.cc/5BFE-MZ95].

⁴⁰⁸ Duany, supra note 100.

⁴⁰⁹ *Id*.

⁴¹⁰ *Id*.

privileged. ⁴¹¹ Close to 248,100 Cubans were legally admitted into the U.S. between 1959 and 1962. An additional 260,600, arrived via Freedom Flights from 1965 to 1973. Yet since the end of the Wet Foot Dry Foot policy, Cuban immigrants are left to enter the U.S. clandestinely or through the visa process. ⁴¹²

In April 2018, the familiar scenario of immigration by boat to the U.S. repeated itself when thirty Cubans were intercepted at sea while on the Florida Straits, by the U.S. Coast Guard. ⁴¹³ All but one of the thirty individuals were sent back to Cuba. ⁴¹⁴ The U.S. Coast Guard reported repatriating 1,532 Cubans during FY 2017. ⁴¹⁵

Specialized programs that benefit Cuban immigrants exclusively still exist. The Cuban Family Reunification Parole ("CFRP") Program, established in 2007, allows eligible U.S. citizens and lawful permanent residents to apply for parole for their family members in Cuba. 416 Once a family member is granted parole through the CFRP, the individuals may come to the U.S. without waiting for their immigrant visa priority dates to become current. 417

A Cuban immigrant who manages to reach the U.S. will find Cuban communities throughout the country that are economically diverse but generally better off than other Hispanic immigrant communities. ⁴¹⁸ They will have higher

⁴¹¹ Sarah Moreno, *Cuban Immigrants No Longer 'Privileged' in the United States*, MIAMI HERALD (May 24, 2018 06:05 PM, updated May 25, 2018 01:03 PM), https://www.miamiherald.com/news/nation-world/world/americas/cuba/article211827094.html.

⁴¹² Duany, supra note 100.

⁴¹³ David Goodhue, Coast Guard Crews Stop Almost 30 People Trying to Reach U.S. from Cuba, MIAMI HERALD (Apr. 26, 2018 05:33 PM, updated May 30, 2018 04:02 PM), https://www.miamiherald.com/news/local/community/florida-keys/article209909599.html.

⁴¹⁴ *Id*.

⁴¹⁵ *Id*.

⁴¹⁶ Cuban Family Reunification Parole Program, 72 Fed. Reg. 65588 (Nov. 21, 2007), see also, https://cu.usembassy.gov/visas/immigrant-visas/cuban-parole-programs/cfrp-program/ (last visited May 22, 2019) [http://perma.cc/7QFP-Y533].

⁴¹⁷ *Id*.

⁴¹⁸ Gustavo López, *Hispanics of Cuban Origin in the United States, 2013: Statistical Profile*, (Sept. 15, 2015), https://www.pewhispanic.org/2015/09/15/hispanics-of-cuban-origin-in-the-united-states-2013/ [http://perma.cc/WH2H-6MNE].

median earnings and lower poverty rates.⁴¹⁹ The number of Cubans that are English dominant is lower than for other Hispanics, but their education attainment is higher.⁴²⁰ About 25% of Cubans twenty-five years and older in the U.S. have a college degree, while the average for Hispanics is 14%.⁴²¹

Texas plays an important part in the Cuban immigration story. From 2013 through 2016, tens of thousands of Cubans tried to enter the U.S. through the Laredo, Texas, CBP sector. Since the 2010 census, thousands of Cubans have entered the state, including at least 29,000 in 2015 who arrived at the Texas-Mexico border.

Cuban immigration to the U.S. has been significant, in part, because of the U.S. willingness to accept political refugees in large numbers from the island throughout the decades. Immigrants from the Northern Triangle countries have not enjoyed the same level of classification as political refugees.

C. Puerto Rican experience.

Puerto Ricans who move to the U.S. are not considered immigrants. The U.S. Congress gave Puerto Ricans citizenship in 1917 through passage of the Jones-Shafroth Act ("Jones Act"). 424 The U.S. had taken possession of the island in 1898, as a result of the Spanish-American War. 425 Prior to the Jones Act,

⁴²⁰ *Id*.

⁴¹⁹ *Id*.

^{420 1}a.

⁴²¹ *Id*.

⁴²² Federation for American Immigration Reform, *Texas' Other Border Surge*, http://www.fairus.org/legislation/state-local-legislation/texas-other-border-surge. (last visited May 22, 2019) [http://perma.cc/838F-LQUW].

⁴²³ Lomi Kriel, *Waves of Cubans are Crossing into Texas*, HOUS. CHRON. (May 28, 2016 Updated: May 31, 2016 2:39 p.m.), https://www.houstonchronicle.com/news/houston-texas/houston/article/Waves-of-Cubans-crossing-into-Texas-7951545.php [http://perma.cc/A7FQ-RW9J].

⁴²⁴ Act of March 2, 1917, 39 Stat. 951 (2017) (codified at 48 U.S.C. §§ 731-916 (2012)) also known as the Puerto Rican Federal Relations Act, and more popularly as the Jones Act.

⁴²⁵ History.com Editors, *Puerto Rico Invaded*, IN THIS DAY IN HISTORY: July 25 (Feb. 9, 2010 last updated Mar. 3, 2019), https://www.history.com/this-day-in-history/puerto-rico-invaded [http://perma.cc/XZK4-TMJU].

Puerto Ricans immigrated to the U.S. in the 19th century, specifically to New York City, as subjects of a Spanish possession. 426

Since the 1950's Puerto Rican migration to the U.S. is primarily through commercial air travel. Puerto Ricans simply need a valid airline ticket and a Puerto Rican issued driver's license or a government-issued I.D. to pass through TSA security screening in Puerto Rico and gain entry into the U.S. 428

The Great Migration of the 1950s is considered the one of the largest waves of Puerto Rican migration to the U.S. when approximately 470,000 Puerto Ricans relocated to the U.S., primarily New York. 429 New York's Puerto Rican population reached 878,000 by the 1970s. 430 Neighboring New Jersey had another 136,000 Puerto Ricans residing there by the 1970s and Florida had at least 482,000 Puerto Ricans by the beginning of the 21st century. 431

Puerto Ricans migrated to dozens of different states, avoiding the large communities in New York City and Orlando through private hiring. A January 2018 article by the *Wall Street Journal* reports the marketing and recruiting efforts by state-based employers directed at individuals in Puerto Rico.⁴³²

⁴²⁶ Gemma Solomons, Becoming "Nuyorican": The History of Puerto Rican Migration to NYC, NATIONAL TRUST FOR HISTORIC PRESERVATION (Oct. 13, 2017), https://savingplaces.org/stories/becoming-nuyorican-history-puerto-rican-migration-nvc#.XC7 TlxKg2w [http://perma.cc/WU32-QCBN].

⁴²⁷ The Great Puerto Rican Migration, ANCESTRY.COM, https://www.ancestry.com/contextux/historicalinsights/puerto-rican-migration [http://perma.cc/T8QG-VFV2].

⁴²⁸ U.S. Customs and Border Protection, Needing a Passport to Enter the United States from U.S. Territories: Will Travelers from U.S. Territories Need to Present a Passport to Enter the United States?, https://help.cbp.gov/app/answers/detail/a_id/980/~/needing-a-passport-to-enter-the-united-states-from-u.s.-territories. (last visited May 22, 2019) [http://perma.cc/47WZ-6WN4].

⁴²⁹ Bryan Caplan, *The Swamping That Wasn't: The Diaspora Dynamics of the Puerto Rican Open Borders Experiment*, Library of Economics and Liberty (Mar 27 2014), https://www.econlib.org/archives/2014/03/the-swamping-th.html [http://perma.cc/2S3D-GMGT].

⁴³⁰ *Id*.

⁴³¹ Id

⁴³² Arian Campo-Flores, Struggling to Fill Jobs, U.S. Employees Look to Storm-Battered Puerto Rico, WALL ST. J. (Jan. 26, 2018 5:30 a.m. ET), https://www.wsj.com/articles/struggling-to-fill-jobs-u-s-employers-look-to-storm-battered-puerto-rico-1516962600 [http://perma.cc/WK2V-BB6Y].

Businesses in Bronson County, Missouri hired more than two hundred Puerto Ricans for a diversity of professions, including welding and nursing. A health-care services company, Bayada Home Healthcare, ran a Facebook ad recruitment campaign in Puerto Rico, and offered 26 Minneapolis-based positions to prospective employees that resided in Puerto Rico. For the Nantucket Hotel & Resort in Massachusetts, hiring Puerto Ricans is preferred than having to go through the U.S. visa process, which a Nantucket employee described as "erratic".

For the thousands of Puerto Ricans employed on the island by the Internal Revenue Service, the Department of Veterans Affairs, and other Federal agencies, migrating to the U.S. can consist of applying to a position located in a U.S. state office of their choice. In 2018, there were 4,229 Veterans Affairs employees and 615 IRS employees on the Island. In the state of Montana, for comparison, Veterans Affairs has 1,552 employees. The U.S. armed forces also have recruiting offices on the island.

In 2014, almost 177,448 Puerto Ricans lived in Texas, more than twice the 69,509 who lived there in 2000.⁴³⁹ Puerto Ricans in Texas had household median incomes of \$53,565, higher than the \$39,322 average for all state side Puerto Ricans.⁴⁴⁰ The Puerto Ricans in Texas are more educated, have higher

⁴³³ *Id*.

⁴³⁴ *Id*.

⁴³⁵ Id.

⁴³⁶ Governing the State and Localities, Federal Employees by State, (last updated Jan. 25, 2019), https://www.governing.com/gov-data/federal-employees-workforce-numbers-by-state.html [http://perma.cc/KV28-SZPN].

⁴³⁷ Id.

⁴³⁸ U.S. Army Ponce Center, https://www.facebook.com/USARMYPONCECENTER/?rf=338196866294016. (last visited May 22, 2019) [http://perma.cc/ED4X-PL5Z].

⁴³⁹ Center for Puerto Rican Studies, Hunter College CUNY, *Puerto Ricans in Texas, the United States, and Puerto* Rico, 2014, Apr. 2016, https://centropr.hunter.cuny.edu/sites/default/files/PDF/STATE%20REPORTS/7.%20TX
-PR-2016-CentroReport.pdf [http://perma.cc/R7K4-8P87].

⁴⁴⁰ *Id.* at 1.

paying jobs and have lower poverty rates than the average stateside Puerto Ricans. All Cash public assistance was received by Puerto Rican families in Texas at a rate of 1.5%, lower than the 6.9% nationally for Puerto Ricans. In Texas, approximately three out of every ten Puerto Rican men, and almost five out of every ten Puerto Rican women, work in either management, business, science, or art professions. Among Puerto Ricans in Texas eighteen and older, 12.9% are veterans.

Harris County has the largest concentration of Puerto Ricans in Texas, followed by Bexar County and Tarrant County. 445 In 2014, approximately 24,510 Puerto Ricans lived in Harris County, 20,675 lived in Bexar County, and 16,515 in Tarrant County. 446

The first two decades of the 21st century have seen increased migration of Puerto Ricans to the U.S.⁴⁴⁷ A lack of economic vibrancy that has lasted over a decade continues to drive Puerto Ricans to the U.S.⁴⁴⁸ Violence associated with the drug war combined with a lack of employment opportunities motivate thousands of Puerto Ricans every year to move to the mainland, or another country.⁴⁴⁹

In 2017, Hurricane Maria impacted the island as a strong category four

⁴⁴¹ *Id*.

⁴⁴² *Id*.

⁴⁴³ *Id.* at 4.

⁴⁴⁴ *Id*.

⁴⁴⁵ *Id*.

⁴⁴⁶ *Id.* at 5.

⁴⁴⁷ D'Vera Cohn, et al., *Puerto Rican Population Declines on Island, Grows on U.S. Mainland*, Aug. 11, 2014, http://www.pewhispanic.org/2014/08/11/puerto-rican-population-declines-on-island-grows-on-u-s-mainland/ [http://perma.cc/A4YA-VLZW].

⁴⁴⁸ Nathan Bomey, 6 Reasons Why Puerto Rico Slid into a Financial Crisis, USA TODAY (Oct. 4, 2017, 11:34 a.m. ET, Updated Oct. 4, 2017, 6:00 p.m. ET), https://www.usatoday.com/story/money/2017/10/04/puerto-rico-debt-crisis-bankruptcy-donald-trump/731091001/_[http://perma.cc/3CCS-6HJH].

⁴⁴⁹ Catherine E. Shoichet, *Puerto Rico: A Forgotten Front in America's Drug War?* CNN (Updated June 10, 2012, 3:29 PM ET), https://www.cnn.com/2012/06/09/justice/puerto-rico-drug-trafficking/index.html [http://perma.cc/D42L-KJZT].

hurricane.⁴⁵⁰ The damages caused by the hurricane drove tens of thousands of Puerto Ricans to evacuate the island in what was described as an exodus.⁴⁵¹ Thousands of evacuees fled the island to Florida where public and private actors tried to support the arriving families and individuals.⁴⁵²

For Puerto Ricans that move to the U.S., they will join a community that tends to be 42% English dominant, higher than the 25% average for Hispanics. The median annual personal earnings for Puerto Ricans are also higher than for other Hispanics (\$25,000 vs. \$21,500). The rate of poverty of Puerto Ricans, at 27%, is also higher than that of the Hispanic average of 25%.

A Puerto Rican's experience entering the U.S. differs from that of an individual from Cuba or the Northern Triangle, as they are not affected by changes in immigration policy and law. Once in the U.S., Puerto Ricans do not have to navigate the asylum or visa system, and as citizens, they can choose to sign up to vote in local, state, and national elections.

III. POLITICAL PRIORITIES AND BEHAVIOR

A. Location: Where Are The Largest Communities?

In 2017, the states with the largest Northern Triangle populations were in the U.S. west and south. California had the largest Salvadoran population at

⁴⁵⁰ CBS News, *Puerto Rico: The Exodus after Hurricane Maria*, CBS NEWS (Sept. 21, 2018, 9:45 PM), https://www.cbsnews.com/news/puerto-rico-exodus-after-hurricane-maria-cbsn-originals/ [http://perma.cc/JH85-H3SA].

⁴⁵¹ *Id*.

⁴⁵² Press Release, Orlando Organizations Launch Abrazo Boricua Coalition to Resettle and Empower Puerto Rican Families, (Apr. 27, 2018), https://www.abrazoboricua.com/blog/2018/4/27/orlando-organizations-launch-abrazoboricua-coalition-to-resettle-and-empower-puerto-rican-families [http://perma.cc/2MA8-YM3E].

⁴⁵³ Gustavo López and Eileen Patten, *Hispanics of Puerto Rican Origin in the United States, 2013*, (Sept. 15, 2015), http://www.pewhispanic.org/2015/09/15/hispanics-of-puerto-rican-origin-in-the-united-states-2013/ [http://perma.cc/Y8WR-753E].

⁴⁵⁴ *Id*.

⁴⁵⁵ *Id*.

727,177, and the most Guatemalans at 418,748.⁴⁵⁶ Texas had the second largest Salvadoran population at 346,005, was home to 167,154 Hondurans and had the third largest Guatemalan population at 103,286.⁴⁵⁷

The States with the most Puerto Ricans and Cubans vary from those with the most Salvadorans, Hondurans, and Guatemalans, in that they tend to be eastern states. Florida had in 2017 the largest Cuban population, at 1,528,066, and the Puerto Rican population was 1,128,225. New York had the second largest population of Puerto Ricans, with approximately 1,113,123. On the other hand, California has the second largest population of Cubans, at 110,792.

Harris County, Texas, is home to the largest populations of Hondurans, Salvadorans, and Guatemalans in the state. While Dallas County has the second largest populations for each of the three Northern Triangle countries. For Cubans, Harris and Dallas counties are the most populated, and for Puerto Ricans, the counties of Harris and Bexar are home to the largest populations in the state.

On the other hand, Miami-Dade County, Florida, is home to 1,000,158 Cubans, and 93,190 Puerto Ricans. 464 The Northern Triangle communities are

⁴⁵⁶ U.S. Census Bureau, 2017 AMERICAN COMMUNITY SURVEY SINGLE-YEAR ESTIMATES, (Sept. 13, 2018), https://factfinder.census.gov/bkmk/table/1.0/en/ACS/17_1YR/B03001/040000US06|0400000US12|0400000US36|0400000US48 [http://perma.cc/ZX7T-UBUG].

⁴⁵⁷ *Id.*

⁴⁵⁸ *Id*.

⁴⁵⁹ *Id*.

⁴⁶⁰ *Id*.

⁴⁶¹ U.S. Census Bureau, 2017 American Community Survey Single-Year estimates, (Sept. 13, 2018), https://factfinder.census.gov/bkmk/table/1.0/en/ACS/17_1YR/B03001/0500000US48029 __0500000US48113 | 0500000US48201 [http://perma.cc/SH57-JTN9].

⁴⁶² *Id*.

⁴⁶³ *Id*.

less populous in this county, but combined, the community approximates 115,955 individuals. Hondurans makeup the biggest share with a 68,660-strong community in Miami-Dade County. In Central Florida, Orange County was home to 194,754 Puerto Ricans, and Osceola County to 101,359. In Central Florida, Orange County was home to 194,754 Puerto Ricans, and Osceola County to 101,359.

B. Voting.

U.S. statutory law and case law has been instrumental in enabling Spanish speaking communities the opportunity to vote. In September 2018, the U.S. District Court for the Northern District of Florida granted an injunction that called for Spanish-language sample ballots to be provided by certain counties, online and at polling sites. The injunction applied to 32 counties with Puerto Rican populations and did not include 20 Florida counties without that population.

In 1970, the Supreme Court up-held a ban on literacy tests used at polling stations to disfranchise voters. Years before, the 1965 Voting Rights Act included a provision specific to Puerto Ricans and other territories. The Act's section 4(e) prohibits denying Puerto Ricans and individuals from the states and territories the right to vote based on their inability to read, write or interpret any matter in English, as long as they meet certain education requirements.

The Texas Election Code requires voting materials to be translated into

⁴⁶⁵ *Id*.

⁴⁶⁶ *Id*.

⁴⁶⁷ I.A

⁴⁶⁸ Madera v. Detzner, 325 F. Supp. 3d 1269, 1273-75 (N.D. Fla. 2018).

⁴⁶⁹ Maggie Astor, Florida Must Provide Election Materials in Spanish, Judge Says, NY TIMES, (last updated Sept. 7, 2018), https://www.nytimes.com/2018/09/07/us/politics/florida-election-spanish.html [http://perma.cc/P6XA-QCYW].

⁴⁷⁰ Oregon v. Mitchell, 400 U.S. 112 (1970).

⁴⁷¹ Voting Rights Act of 1965, Pub. L. 89-110, Title I § 2, 79 Stat. 437, 439 (1965) (codified at 52 U.S.C. § 10301 (2012)).

⁴⁷² *Id*.

Spanish in counties that meet specific criteria.⁴⁷³ In addition, presiding judges in certain election precincts are to make reasonable efforts to appoint clerks who are fluent in English and Spanish.⁴⁷⁴

In California, the Secretary of State designates certain precincts and counties that must provide certain election materials in the Spanish language.⁴⁷⁵ California Secretary of State, Alex Padilla, said in a 2018 press release: "Elections are the cornerstone of our democracy and voting rights include access to voting information in a voters preferred language".⁴⁷⁶

C. Political Issues.

The political issues that are important to individuals from Northern Triangle communities can vary from those that are important to the Puerto Rican and Cuban communities. These differences can amount to thousands of voters within these communities that may break from the traditional behavior that are recognized to characterize the Hispanic community.

In the U.S. 29% of Honduran immigrants are proficient in the English language.⁴⁷⁷ In comparison, Puerto Ricans moving from the island to the U.S., 60% are proficient with the English language, twice the rate of Honduran immigrants.⁴⁷⁸

Among Salvadorans in the U.S., 35% are bilingual and 63% speak mainly

 $^{^{473}}$ See Tex. Elec. Code Ann. § 272.002 (2010).

⁴⁷⁴ See Tex. Elec. Code Ann. § 272.009 (2010).

⁴⁷⁵ See Cal. Elec. Code § 14201 (2003).

⁴⁷⁶ SOS Press Office, Six New Languages Added to 2018 Elections Language Assistance Requirements, (Jan. 18, 2018), https://www.sos.ca.gov/administration/news-releases-and-advisories/six-new-languages-added-2018-election-language-assistance-requirements/[http://perma.cc/3XWG-Y8UQ].

⁴⁷⁷ Gustavo López, *Hispanics of Honduran Origin in the United States, 2013: Statistical Profile*, PEW HISPANIC (Sept. 15, 2015), http://www.pewhispanic.org/2015/09/15/hispanics-of-honduran-origin-in-the-united-states-2013/ [http://perma.cc/HA9X-H2KK].

⁴⁷⁸ Gustavo López and Eileen Patten, *Hispanics of Puerto Rican Origin in the United States, 2013*, PEW HISPANIC (Sept. 15, 2015), http://www.pewhispanic.org/2015/09/15/hispanics-of-puerto-rican-origin-in-the-united-states-2013/ [http://perma.cc/8NJ6-SJUT].

Spanish.⁴⁷⁹ For Puerto Ricans, 41% are bilingual and 42% speak mainly English, compared to 3% of Salvadorans who speak mainly English.⁴⁸⁰⁴⁸¹

A poll conducted in 2014 by the Pew Research Center showed 17% of Spanish-dominant Hispanics were angry because the Obama Administration had delayed executive action on deportation relief, but only 5% of English-dominant Hispanics expressed anger. When asked if they could vote for a candidate they disagreed with on immigration issues, but agreed on everything else, 29% of English Dominant Hispanics said they would not, compared to 49% of Spanish dominant Hispanics who said they would not.

Considering that Puerto Ricans in the U.S. are more dominant and proficient in English than Salvadorans and Hondurans, potentially more Salvadorans and Honduras will be angry at the Obama administration than Puerto Ricans, and more might consider the immigration issue a deal breaker at the ballot box. It can be said that Salvadorans and Hondurans, as a community, are likely to have the political priorities or behavior of more Spanish dominant Hispanics while Puerto Ricans will lean more towards the preferences exhibited by bilingual and English dominant Hispanics.

When asked if it had become more difficult to be Hispanic in the U.S., four out of every ten English-dominant Hispanics said yes, but almost seven out of every ten Spanish-dominant Hispanics said yes.⁴⁸⁴ Hispanics that feel their

⁴⁷⁹ Gustavo López, Hispanics of Salvadoran Origin in the United States, 2013: Statistical Profile, PEW HISPANIC (Sept. 15, 2015), http://www.pewhispanic.org/2015/09/15/hispanics-of-salvadoran-origin-in-the-united-states-2013/.[http://perma.cc/VWH5-U5Z5].

⁴⁸⁰ Supra note 195.

⁴⁸¹ Supra note 194.

⁴⁸² Mark Hugo Lopez, et al, *Hispanics and Their Views of Immigration Reform*, IN LATINO SUPPORT FOR DEMOCRATS FALLS, BUT DEMOCRATIC ADVANTAGE REMAINS, (Oct. 29, 2014), https://www.pewresearch.org/wp-content/uploads/sites/5/2014/10/2014-10-29 NSL-latino-politics.pdf. [http://perma.cc/5PMN-859N].

⁴⁸³ Id

⁴⁸⁴ Mark Hugo Lopez, et al., *Latinos Have Become More Pessimistic About Their Place in America*, IN MORE LATINOS HAVE SERIOUS CONCERNS ABOUT THEIR PLACE IN AMERICA UNDER TRUMP (Oct. 25, 2018), https://www.pewhispanic.org/wp-content/uploads/sites/5/2018/10/Pew-Research-Center Latinos-have-Serious-Concerns-

existence in the U.S. is more difficult, will be inclined to want a political candidate that promises change.

The educational attainment among members of the three communities in the U.S. differs and indicates their political priorities can differ, too. Among Hondurans in the U.S., 9% of adults twenty-five or older are estimated to have at least a Bachelor's Degree. For Puerto Ricans, that number rises to 18%, and for Cubans to 25%. Research by the Pew Center indicates that 32% of Latino voters in the U.S., with at least some college education, consider the immigration issue a deal-breaker when voting, but for Latinos voters with just a high school diploma, the number rises to 40%. The Honduran community in the U.S. would be, overall, more inclined to consider the immigration issue a deal-breaker than the Puerto Rican and Cuban communities.

In 2018, when asked if they worried about deportation, 62% of English-dominant Hispanics said they did not, compared to 70% of Spanish dominant Hispanics who said they worried some, or a lot. 489 Considering the presence of thousands of undocumented immigrants from El Salvador, Honduras, Cuba and Guatemala in the U.S., but virtually none from Puerto Rico, Puerto Ricans, as a community, are less exposed to the immigration system and its consequences, certainly less so than the Northern Triangle and Cuban communities.

About-Their-Place-in-America 2018-10-25.pdf [http://perma.cc/BJ8C-GJ5V].

485 Supra note 193.

⁴⁸⁶ Gustavo López, *Hispanics of Cuban Origin in the United States, 2013: Statistical Profile*, (Sept. 15, 2015), https://www.pewhispanic.org/2015/09/15/hispanics-of-cuban-origin-in-the-united-states-2013/ [http://perma.cc/6AFT-NGV4].

⁴⁸⁷ Supra note 194.

⁴⁸⁸ Mark Hugo Lopez, et al, *Hispanics and Their Views of Immigration Reform*, IN LATINO SUPPORT FOR DEMOCRATS FALLS, BUT DEMOCRATIC ADVANTAGE REMAINS (Oct. 29, 2014), https://www.pewresearch.org/wp-content/uploads/sites/5/2014/10/2014-10-29_NSL-latino-politics.pdf [http://perma.cc/8G65-UTY6].

⁴⁸⁹ Mark Hugo Lopez, et al., Views of Immigration Policy: Half of Hispanics Say they Worry About Deportation, IN MORE LATINOS HAVE SERIOUS CONCERNS ABOUT THEIR PLACE IN AMERICA UNDER TRUMP 31 (Oct. 25, 2018), https://www.pewhispanic.org/wpcontent/uploads/sites/5/2018/10/Pew-Research-Center_Latinos-have-Serious-Concerns-About-Their-Place-in-America_2018-10-25.pdf [http://perma.cc/5Q4V-LK35].

In 2016, Cubans and Puerto Ricans comprised 31% and 28% of the Hispanic vote in Florida. An October 2018 poll of registered Hispanic voters showed similarities and differences in how these two communities view political issues. Diversity of opinion also exists on the topic of healthcare. Most Puerto Rican voters, 57%, opposed the repeal of Obama Care, but 60% of Cuban voters expressed support for the repeal.

Another issue of contention would be that of Puerto Rican statehood. While 83% of Puerto Rican voters in the poll expressed support for statehood, only 64% of Cubans supported it, and 20% of Cubans opposed. On the issue of extending federal aid to Puerto Ricans who settled in Florida due to Hurricane Maria, 11% of Puerto Ricans opposed more aid but the opposition rose to 23% among Cubans.

When it comes to the issue of immigration, Cuban and Puerto Rican voters shared similar and opposing views. Half of Cuban voters in the poll approved of President Trump's immigration policies but only 27% of Puerto Rican voters approved. When it came to extending the Differed Action for Childhood Arrivals program (DACA), the two voting blocs expressed support for extending the program, with 8 out of every 10 Cubans and Puerto Ricans supporting it. 496

⁴⁹⁰ Latinos in the 2016 election: Florida, (Jan. 19, 2016), http://www.pewhispanic.org/fact-sheet/latinos-in-the-2016-election-florida/ [http://perma.cc/6PP4D-4KUM].

⁴⁹¹ Mason-Dixon Polling & Strategy, *October 2018 Florida Hispanic Voter Poll*, POLITICO (Oct. 2018), https://www.politico.com/f/?id=00000166-cb4c-d7ac-abfe-ebcf677c0000 [http://perma.cc/ERF7-RF2F].

⁴⁹² *Id.* at 10.

⁴⁹³ *Id.* at 17.

⁴⁹⁴ *Id.* at 16.

⁴⁹⁵ *Id.* at 11.

⁴⁹⁶ *Id.* at 12.

D. Political Behavior and Party Leanings.

The political behavior of the three communities in the U.S. also varies when it comes to voter turnout and political party leanings. In the 2012 election, the Cuban eligible voter turnout was 68%, the South and Central American was 57%, with the Puerto Rican rate at 53%. In the 2018 Florida midterm election, the 206,000 voters in the state who identified as Puerto Rico-born turned out to vote at a 47% rate, compared to the 59% general turnout for the state 498.

The differences in voter turnout among the three communities are evident from early voting. Analysis of early voting data in the 2018 Florida midterms revealed 45% of Cuban voters casted early ballots compared to just 27% of Puerto Rican voters. These disparities in voter turnout amount to thousands of votes and can mean all the difference in close elections.

In California, the state with the most individuals from the Northern Triangle community, 60% of Latino voters are registered under the Democratic Party. Salvadorans in California constitute the largest Northern Triangle voting bloc in the state, comprising 4.3% of the Hispanic eligible voters. While Mexicans comprise 82% of eligible Hispanic voters, and Puerto Ricans 2%. Nationally, Salvadorans represent 2.6% of the Hispanic eligible voters, more

⁴⁹⁷ Mark Hugo Lopez and Ana Gonzalez-Barrera, *Dissecting the Latino Electorate*, IN INSIDE THE 2012 LATINO ELECTORATE (June 3, 2013), https://www.pewresearch.org/wp-content/uploads/sites/5/2013/05/the-latino-electorate_2013-06.pdf. [http://perma.cc/KY3D-YKQ6].

⁴⁹⁸ S.V. Date, *Dems Hope Florida Puerto Ricans' Dislike of Trump Translates to Actual Votes Next Time*, HUFF POST (Apr. 21, 2019, last updated Apr. 22, 2019), https://www.huffpost.com/entry/trump-florida-puerto-rico n 5cbccca5e4b068d795cdde60 [http://perma.cc/EB3F-ZACJ].

⁴⁹⁹ Mark Baldassare, et al, *Just the Facts Race and Voting in California*, Public Policy Institute of California (August 2018), https://www.ppic.org/publication/race-and-voting-in-california [http://perma.cc/6JHA-AM9M].

⁵⁰⁰ Pew Research Center, *Latinos in the 2016 election: California*, HISPANIC TRENDS (Jan. 19, 2016), http://www.pewhispanic.org/fact-sheet/latinos-in-the-2016-election-california/ [http://perma.cc/CWM8-NVBC].

than any other Northern Triangle community, and Puerto Ricans are at 14.1%.⁵⁰²

In Texas, Puerto Ricans form the largest pool of eligible voters among the three communities, followed by Salvadorans and Cubans.⁵⁰³ Puerto Ricans make up 2.4% of the Hispanic electorate, and Salvadorans 1.6%.⁵⁰⁴ In the 2018 Texas midterms, 64% of Hispanics voted for the Democratic Party Senatorial candidate, and 53% for the Democratic Party Governor candidate.⁵⁰⁵

The Cuban community in the U.S. has been recognized as leaning to the Republican Party since the 1960s, but younger Cubans in recent elections have been shifting towards the Democratic Party.⁵⁰⁶ Puerto Ricans are known to lean Democrat, but in the 2016 election, those who leaned Republican were more likely to have actually voted.⁵⁰⁷ A USA Today article gave insight into how the Republican Party can approach Puerto Ricans in Florida. ⁵⁰⁸ For Florida International University Political Scientist, Dario Moreno, Republicans don't have to try and win the Puerto Rican vote in Florida. "It's not about winning", Moreno said, "But rather lowering the Democratic margin".⁵⁰⁹

⁵⁰² T.d

⁵⁰³ Pew Research Trends, *Latinos in the 2016 Elections: Texas*, HISPANIC TRENDS (Jan. 19, 2016), http://www.pewhispanic.org/fact-sheet/latinos-in-the-2016-election-texas/ [http://perma.cc/AYT-3C6Z].

⁵⁰⁴ Id.

⁵⁰⁵ *Id*.

⁵⁰⁶ Francisco Navas, In Miami, Cuban Americans have the power to push the state to the left, THE GUARDIAN (Nov. 4, 2018 03.00 EST, corrected Nov. 5, 2018), https://www.theguardian.com/us-news/2018/nov/04/miami-cubans-midterm-elections-voters [http://perma.cc/W29B-UN9X].

⁵⁰⁷ Juan Arroyo-Flores, et at, *Understanding Puerto Rican Voting in the United States*, SCHOLARS (Apr. 23, 2019), https://scholars.org/contribution/understanding-puerto-rican-voting-united-states [http://perma.cc/WZE5-KLEG].

Deborah Barfield Berry, Midterm: Puerto Ricans Displaced by Hurricane Maria May Prove Pivotal in Florida Elections, USA TODAY (Oct. 17, 2018, 2:00 a.m. ET, updated Oct. 18, 2018, 2:14 p.m. ET), https://www.usatoday.com/story/news/politics/elections/2018/10/17/midterms-displaced-puerto-ricans-courted-swing-state-florida/1518309002/ [http://perma.cc/52S7-EYA2].

⁵⁰⁹ Id.

IV. CONCLUSION.

It is crucial for political actors in the U.S. to understand the differences in political behavior and priorities exhibited by the different Hispanic communities. This means considering why and how a specific community arrived in the U.S. The background of the Cuban community has differences from that of Northern Triangle nations, and these differences are exhibited through political behavior.

A voter turnout difference of 5% or 10% between communities can equal thousands of votes and mean the difference in a close election.

The treatment U.S. law and policy affords the individuals of each community helps define the political priorities and behavior of that community. It is clear that Cubans and individuals from the Northern Triangle can have a harder time entering the U.S. than those from Puerto Rico. Individuals from the Northern Triangle and Cuba might focus on immigration policy because they are still trying to bring family members to the U.S. The more substantial the impediments U.S. law and policy throw in the way of a community entering the U.S., the more that community may consider immigration as a top issue when voting.

It is the responsibility of each community to organize and study itself, so it can better project itself and its needs to the rest of the U.S., and the world. Think tanks, journals, and political outreach are some of the vehicle's communities can use to make their voices counted and eventually improve their quality of life.